

DEADWOOD HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Wednesday, August 8, 2018 ~ 5:00 p.m.

City Hall, 108 Sherman Street, Deadwood, South Dakota

1. Call meeting to Order
2. Approval of HPC Meeting Minutes
 - a. July 25, 2018 Regular Meeting
3. Voucher Approval
4. HP Programs and Revolving Loan Program
 - a. Grant Voucher Approval
 - b. HP Grant Applications – **Exhibit A**
 - i. Thomas & JoBerta Pehrson – 31 Jackson Street – Elderly Resident Program
 - ii. Karin Wood – 42 Lincoln Avenue – Wood Windows and Doors Program
 - iii. Travis Floyd – 81 Stewart – Foundation Program
 - iv. Cem Iskender – 666 Main Street -- Historic Façade Easement Program – **Exhibit B**
 - c. Revolving Loan Program Voucher Approval
 - d. Revolving Loan – Loan Requests – **Exhibit C**
 - i. Ralph Hoggatt – 61 Sherman – Commercial Life Safety Loan
 - ii. BH Mining Museum – 9 Parksdale, Lead – Commercial Life Safety Loan
 - iii. Michael Johnson – 8 Van Buren – Extension Request
 - iv. George Mitchell – 29 Terrace – Request to Forgive
5. Old or General Business
 - a. Main Street Initiative update
 - b. Franklin Hotel – Façade Easement Program update – **No Exhibit**
 - c. Chalets at Deadwood Mountain Grand Project – Discussion – **No Exhibit**
6. New Matters before the Deadwood Historic District Commission
7. New Matters before the Deadwood Historic Preservation Commission
 - a. PA 180101 – Adrian & Annette Hoines – 65 Forest Avenue – Replace Roof – **Exhibit D**
 - b. PA 180134–Jeff & Lauren Trouton – 33 Jackson – Replace Roof–**Exhibit E**
 - c. PA 180136 – Karin Wood – 42 Lincoln – Replace Storm Windows – **Exhibit F**
 - d. PA 180141 – Tom Julius – 33 ½ Jackson – Replace Roof – **Exhibit G**
8. Items from Citizens not on agenda (*Items considered but no action will be taken at this time.*)
9. Staff Report (*Items considered but no action will be taken at this time.*)
10. Committee Reports (*Items will be considered but no action will be taken at this time.*)
11. Other Business

Adjournment -- **All Applications **MUST** arrive at the City of Deadwood Historic Preservation Office by 5:00 p.m. MST on the 1st or 3^d Wednesday of every month in order to be considered at the next Historic Preservation Commission Meeting.*

City of Deadwood
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
Wednesday, August 8, 2018

Present Historic Preservation Commission: Michael Johnson, Lyman Toews, Beverly Posey, Ann Ochse, Robin Carmody and Thomas Blair

Absent Dale Berg

Present City Commission: Dave Ruth Jr., Quentin Riggins, Sharon Martinisko and Charles Turbiville

Present Staff: Kevin Kuchenbecker, Historic Preservation Officer and Meghan Wittmis, Administrative Assistant were present.

All motions passed unanimously unless otherwise stated.

A quorum present, Chairman Michael Johnson called the Deadwood Historic Preservation Commission meeting to order Wednesday, August 8, 2018 at 5:00 p.m. in the Commission Room located in City Hall at 108 Sherman Street in Deadwood, SD.

Approval of HPC Minutes:

July 25, 2018 Regular Meeting

It was moved by Ms. Ochse and seconded by Mr. Blair to approve the HPC minutes of Wednesday, July 25, 2018. Aye – All. Motion carried.

Voucher Approval:

It was moved by Mr. Toews and seconded by Ms. Posey to approve the HP Operating Account in the amount of \$60,506.25. Aye – All. Motion carried.

Revolving Loan Fund and Historic Preservation Programs:

HP Program Grant Funds

It was moved by Mr. Toews and seconded by Ms. Posey to approve HP Grant Fund disbursements in the amount of \$14,731.85, based on information as presented. Aye - All. Motion carried.

HP Grant Applications – Exhibit A

Mr. Kuchenbecker stated the following applicants have applied for HP Grant Programs. Thomas and JoBerta Pehrson, 31 Jackson, Elderly Resident Program; Karin Wood, 42 Lincoln, Wood Windows & Doors Program; and Travis Floyd, 81 Stewart, Foundation Program. All applicants meet the guidelines therefore staff recommends approval. ***It was moved by Mr. Blair and seconded by Ms. Ochse to approve the grant applications for Thomas and JoBerta Pehrson, 31 Jackson, Elderly Resident Program; Karin Wood, 42 Lincoln, Wood Windows & Doors Program; and Travis Floyd, 81 Stewart, Foundation Program. Aye - All. Motion carried.***

HP Grant Applications – Exhibit B

Mr. Kuchenbecker stated this application is for the Façade Easement program for 666 Main Street, Gem Iskender. The applicant wishes to restore the open glass front. ***It was moved by Ms. Ochse and seconded by Ms. Posey to enter Gem Iskender, 666 Main Street, into the Historic Façade Easement Program. Aye – All. Motion carried.***

Revolving Loan Program Voucher Approval

It was moved by Mr. Blair and seconded by Ms. Posey to approve HP Revolving Loan Fund disbursements in the amount of \$24,108.60, based on information as presented. Aye - All. Motion carried.

Revolving Loan Program – Exhibit C

- i. Ralph Hoggatt – 61 Sherman – Commercial Life Safety loan
It was moved by Mr. Blair and seconded by Ms. Posey to grant a commercial life safety loan to Ralph Hoggat, 61 Sherman. Aye – All. Motion carried.
- ii. BH Mining Museum – 9 Parksdale, Lead – Commercial Life Safety loan
This loan was approved at the July 25, 2018 HP Commission meeting contingent upon recommendation from Loan Committee. Loan Committee met on August 1, 2018 and recommended granting this loan.
- iii. Michael Johnson – 8 Van Buren – Extension Request
It was moved by Mr. Toews and seconded by Ms. Posey to grant a three month extension to Michael Johnson, 8 Van Buren. Aye – All. Mr. Johnson abstained. Motion carried.
- iv. George Mitchell – 29 Terrace – Request to Forgive
It was moved by Ms. Ochse and seconded by Mr. Blair to forgive the loan for George Mitchell, 29 Terrace. Aye – All. Motion carried.

Old or General Business:

Main Street Initiative Update – Kevin Kuchenbecker – No Exhibit

Mr. Kuchenbecker stated there was a meeting with the Governor on August 2nd. The Governor urged the City to do a Construction Manager at Risk form for the project. Staff is currently working on the RFP and Resolution. At this point he verbally committed \$300,000 towards the project.

Franklin Hotel – Façade Easement Program Update – No Exhibit

Mr. Stafford updated the Commission on the progress of the façade easement project on the Franklin Hotel. He would like the Commission to consider an easement for the south side of the hotel. The south side of the building is in need of tuck-pointing, replace missing bricks and repair the 225 windows. Mr. Toews stated the budget for this year and next year are tight unless the City gets a bond to cover items like retaining walls and the public gathering space, so some thinking and prioritizing will need to be done. Mr. Toews also stated he would like to see the window air units eliminated. The Commission thanked the Franklin Hotel representatives for the update.

Chalets at Deadwood Mountain Grand Project – No Exhibit

Mr. Oswald stated plans are in motion for the chalets and they will be taking in to consideration all the feedback they received last time. The team they have in place includes Matt Pike and Chamberlain Architects. Mr. Burns stated if the project can't be done well then he doesn't want to do it. Mr. Burns will be looking for a better way to approach this project by starting with HP and working from there. The hope for the new design will be smaller two-story buildings with no garages and will fit better in the location. Mr. Johnson asked how many units they're looking at. Mr. Oswald stated he can't give an answer right now; it will depend on the design and what works for the area. Mr. Toews asked that they speak to the residents on the hill, keep them informed and address their concerns. Mr. Conrad stated a letter had gone out to the residents. Mr. Conrad also stated he has been up there quite a few times and seems like every time he's up there no one is home, so they sent the letter to reach everyone. Mr. Conrad is hoping to work through the Block Clubs to keep residents informed, show plans and so forth. Mr. Kuchenbecker stated McGovern Hill does not have an official Block Club. One resident from McGovern Hill stated no one has come up to speak with her or her neighbor. One resident asked if they would be using McGovern Hill Road for construction. Mr. Conrad stated they would have to use it for construction until the new road was completed. The resident stated they didn't want them using McGovern Hill Road at all. Mr. Johnson stated all of these concerns need to be addressed before starting the project. Mr. Ruth Jr. asked that the Commission please hold them to talking to all the residents.

New Matters before the Deadwood Historic District Commission

New Matters before the Deadwood Historic Preservation Commission

PA 180101 – Adrian & Annette Hoines – 65 Forest Avenue – Replace Roof – Exhibit D

Mr. Kuchenbecker stated this is for 65 Forest Avenue, Adrian and Annette Hoines. The applicant is requesting permission to re-roof the entire house due to hail damage. The house currently has historic wooden shingles but the applicant is requesting to replace them with asphalt shingles. It is staff opinion the wood shingles are an architecturally identifying characteristic to the few houses that remain with the wood shingles. The insurance company should cover the replacement cost of wood shingles. It is staff's opinion, the proposed work and changes do not encroach upon, damage or destroy a historic resource but does have an adverse effect on the character of the building. It is also staff's opinion it does not have an overall adverse effect on the historic character of the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District. Kuchenbecker stated there are a couple of these on the agenda tonight, the next one is looking at an alternative to asphalt but still keep the look of the wood shingles. Ms. Ochse stated if we are going to allow fiberglass parapets on buildings downtown, we can't object to shakes that look like shakes but aren't. Mr. Kuchenbecker stated you have to take these on case by case bases, the building downtown is replacing a missing piece, and this is replacing a damages piece that is still there. There are substitute materials out there that should be considered. Mr. Toews stated there is an option with a lot of appeal, the option the Trouton's are looking at, it leaves the character of a shake and is a durable product. Mr. Toews would like to see the shakes left on the house because losing that would be a shame. Ms. Hoines asked if all the homes on Forest Avenue are historic. Mr. Kuchenbecker stated a number of them are historic. Ms. Hoines stated they are the only ones that have wood shingles, everyone else has asphalt shingles. She wants to know why they have to have wood shingles when they would rather have asphalt for the appearance, durability and the concern of fire. Mr. Toews stated the other option is not a wood product. Ms. Hoines stated she knows it isn't but it will be more expensive and they don't yet know what their insurance will cover. Mr. Toews asked the applicants to please look at and concenter the alternative option. ***It was moved by Mr. Toews and seconded by Mr. Blair to table the discussion, move to the next item on the agenda, 33 Jackson, and then come back. Aye – All. Motion carried.***

It was moved by Mr. Toews and seconded by Mr. Blair to continue the discussion on 65 Forest Avenue. Aye – All. Motion carried.

Mr. Toews asked if the applicants would be willing to look into the product approved for 33 Jackson. Mr. Hoines asked if they would still have the option of going with wood shingles. The answer was yes they would still have that choice. Ms. Hoines asked what the durability of these shingles are compared to asphalt. Mr. Kuchenbecker stated according to the manufacture they have a 50 year warranty where asphalt last about 40 years. Mr. Hoines asked if they would have a choice of putting asphalt on. Ms. Posey stated they are looking for something that replicates the shake look so it will still look like an historic home. Mr. Hoines stated he would check with his insurance company on the alternative product. Ms. Hoines stated they have shingles not shakes. ***It was moved by Mr. Blair and seconded by Mr. Toews to continue this item until the next meeting. Aye - All. Motion Carried.*** Mr. Hoines asked if Historic Preservation would pick up the extra cost if the insurance company doesn't cover the total cost. Mr. Toews stated there isn't currently a program for that. Mr. Kuchenbecker stated there is a life safety loan.

PA 180134 – Jeff & Lauren Trouton – 33 Jackson – Replace Roof – Exhibit E

Mr. Kuchenbecker stated this is a contributing structure located in the Ingleside Planning Unit. The applicant is requesting permission to change the shake roof to a shake-like product, example on the table, as the cost of keeping the shakes is beyond financial ability. The roof is only five years old and badly damaged by hail. There are other products on the market that very closely imitate the look of wood shingles that could be considered. These materials may also be a safer product from fire. If the product is correctly chosen, the proposed work and changes do not encroach upon, damage or destroy a historic resource or have an adverse effect on the character of the building or the historic character of the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District. Staff is good with this product. There is also a similar product made of rubber that agenda item 7D, the twin to this house, is looking at. Mr. Toews asked about the fire rating for this product, is it better than wood. Mr. Kuchenbecker stated yes they are better than wood. ***It was moved by Mr. Toews and seconded by Ms. Ochse based upon all the evidence presented, this project does not encroach upon, damage, or destroy any historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places, and therefore move to grant a project approval. Aye - All. Motion Carried.***

PA 180136 – Karin Wood – 42 Lincoln – Replace Storm Windows – Exhibit F

Mr. Kuchenbecker stated this is a contributing structure located in the Ingleside Planning Unit constructed in 1885. The applicant is requesting permission to replace damaged aluminum storms with wood storms and repair windows. The proposed work and changes do not encroach upon, damage or destroy a historic resource or have an adverse effect on the character of the building or the historic character of the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District. ***It was moved by Ms. Ochse and seconded by Ms. Posey based upon all the evidence presented, this project does not encroach upon, damage, or destroy any historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places, and therefore move to grant a project approval. Aye - All. Motion Carried.***

PA 180141 – Tom Julius – 33 1/2 Jackson – Replace Roof – Exhibit G

Mr. Kuchenbecker stated this is the twin to the Trouton's house. The applicant is requesting Permission to re-roof after hail damage using a rubber composite that looks like shakes but withstands weather better. This product closely resembles wood shingles and in staff's opinion is a satisfactory substitute. Based on this material, it is staff's opinion, the proposed work and changes do not encroach upon, damage or destroy a historic resource or have an adverse effect on the character of the building or the historic character of the State and National Register Historic Districts or the Deadwood National Historic Landmark District. It would be nice if the two roofs match since they are twin houses. ***It was moved by Mr. Toews and seconded by Mr. Blair based upon all the evidence presented, this project does not encroach upon, damage, or destroy any historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places, and therefore move to grant a project approval contingent on use of same material used for 33 Jackson. Aye - All. Motion Carried.***

Items from Citizens not on Agenda

Staff Report: *(items will be considered but no action will be taken at this time.)*

Mr. Kuchenbecker stated it has been quiet this week in the office. We are working on the resolution to allow us to put the RFP out for the Construction Manager at Risk. We will be talking to the consultant on the Main Street Master Plan. There have been a lot of building permits to sign, when there is no change to a roof it doesn't go through HP. At a three/two vote the Main Street Arch was funded by the City Commission. Mary Jo announced her retirement in October.

Committee Reports:

Mr. Toews thanked the Commission for supporting the Black Hills Mining Museum.

The Historic Preservation Commission Meeting adjourned at 6:16 p.m.

ATTEST:

Chairman, Historic Preservation Commission
Meghan Wittmis, Historic Preservation Office/Recording Secretary