

DEADWOOD HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Wednesday, September 26, 2012 ~ 5:00 p.m.

City Hall, 108 Sherman Street, Deadwood, South Dakota

1. Call meeting to Order
2. Approval of Minutes
3. Voucher Approval
4. Old or General Business
 - a. Donations #2012.11 and #2012.13 – City of Deadwood Archives
5. New Matters before the Deadwood Historic District Commission
 - a. Case# 12050 – 668 Main Street – Stucco Repair – Don & Christine Dunham
6. New Matters before the Deadwood Historic Preservation Commission
 - a. Case# 12051 – 388 Main Street – Gate/Arch – Wayne Morris
 - b. Case# 12052 – 7 Spring Road – Pergola – Lee Stier
 - c. Case# 12053 – 33 & 33 ½ Jackson Street – Re-Roofing – Alex Maclachlan
 - d. Case# 12054 – 68 Main Street – Demolition – KLK Ventures
7. Revolving Loan Fund/Retaining Wall Program Update
 - a. Retaining Wall Applications
 - i. 95 Stewart – Lori & Randy Johnston – Permission to bid wall
 - ii. 25 & 29 Terrace – George Mitchell – Permission to bid wall
 - b. Revolving loan Program/Disbursements
 - i. 63 Taylor – John & Terry Rodiack
 - ii. 784 Main Street – Les & Shirley Karas
 - c. Retaining Wall Program/Disbursements
8. Items from Citizens not on agenda (*Items will be considered but no action will be taken at this time.*)
9. Staff Report (*Items will be considered but no action will be taken at this time.*)
10. Committee Reports (*Items will be considered but no action will be taken at this time.*)
11. Other business
12. Adjournment

All Applications **MUST arrive at the City of Deadwood Historic Preservation Office by 5:00 p.m. MST on the 1st or 3rd Wednesday of every month in order to be considered at the next Historic Preservation Commission Meeting.*

CITY OF DEADWOOD
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Wednesday, September 26, 2012

Present Historic Preservation Commission: Vice-Chair, Willie Steinlicht, Lynn Namminga, Laura Floyd, Anita Hansen, and Steve Olson. Historic Preservation Officer, Kevin Kuchenbecker and City Attorney, Jason Campbell, were also present.

Absent: Matt Pike and George Milos.

Present Deadwood City Commission: Mayor Francis Toscana, and Commissioner Jim Van Den Eykel.

All motions passed unanimously unless otherwise stated.

A quorum present, the Historic Preservation Commission Vice-Chair, Willie Steinlicht, called the Deadwood Historic Preservation Commission meeting to order on Wednesday, September 26, 2012 at 5:00 p.m. in Deadwood City Hall located at 108 Sherman Street, Deadwood, SD.

Approval of Minutes:

It was moved by Mr. Olson and seconded by Mr. Namminga to approve the Minutes of Wednesday, September 12, 2012 as presented. Aye – All. Motion carried.

Voucher Approval:

Operating Account

It was moved by Ms. Floyd and seconded by Mr. Olson to approve the HP Operating Account in the amount of \$6,381.61. Aye – All. Motion carried.

Bonded Account

It was moved by Ms. Floyd and seconded by Ms. Hansen to approve the HP Bonded Account in the amount of \$20,870.36. Aye – All. Motion carried.

Old or General Business:

Donations #2012.11 and #2012.13 – City of Deadwood Archives

Mr. Kuchenbecker said the City of Deadwood Archives is requesting permission to formally accept three books and three photographic postcards from the Days of '76 celebration donated by Al Alschuler, along with Deadwood High School newsletters from 1943 to 1954 donated by Keith Shostrom. Mr. Kuchenbecker noted the Archaeology, Archives, and Acquisitions (AAA) Committee had recommended acceptance of these items. (The Memorandum dated September 21, 2012 is attached hereto on Exhibit A and incorporated herein by this

reference.) *It was moved by Mr. Olson and seconded by Ms. Floyd to accept Donations #2012.11 and #2012.13 into the City's permanent collection as recommended by the AAA Committee and presented in the Memorandum dated September 21, 2012. Aye – All. Motion carried.*

New Matters before the Deadwood Historic District Commission

Case# 12050 – 668 Main Street – Stucco Repair – Don & Christine Dunham

Mr. Kuchenbecker reviewed his Staff Report for permission to repair and paint the stucco finish on the side and rear of the resource located at 668 Main Street as submitted. He noted the color of the paint would be decided upon with consultation from the Historic Preservation Office. (The Staff Report, dated September 21, 2012, is attached hereto on Exhibit B and incorporated herein by this reference.) *It was moved by Mr. Olson and seconded by Mr. Namminga, based upon the guidance found in DCO 17.68.050, that the exterior alteration proposed is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological or cultural aspects of the district and moved to grant a Certification of Appropriateness to Case# 12050, 668 Main Street, Don and Christine Dunham as submitted. Aye – All. Motion carried.*

New Matters before the Deadwood Historic Preservation Commission

Case# 12051 – 388 Main Street – Gate/Arch – Wayne Morris

Mr. Kuchenbecker reviewed his Staff Report for permission to install a gate/arch at 388 Main Street as submitted. Mr. Kuchenbecker noted this would be an easily reversible alteration. (The Staff Report, dated September 21, 2012 is attached hereto on Exhibit C and incorporated herein by this reference.) *It was moved by Mr. Namminga and seconded by Mr. Olson, based upon all the evidence presented, that the project DOES NOT encroach upon, damage, or destroy any historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places, and therefore moved to grant a project approval to Case# 12051, 388 Main Street, Wayne Morris as submitted. Aye – All. Motion carried.*

Case# 12052 – 7 Spring Road – Pergola – Lee Stier

Mr. Kuchenbecker reviewed his Staff Report for permission to construct a pergola over the outdoor kitchen at 7 Spring Road as submitted. (The Staff Report, dated September 21, 2012 is attached hereto on Exhibit D and incorporated herein by this reference.) *It was moved by Ms. Floyd and seconded by Ms. Hansen, based upon all the evidence presented, that the project DOES NOT encroach upon, damage, or destroy any historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places, and therefore moved to grant a project approval to Case# 12052, 7 Spring Road, Lee Stier as submitted. Aye – All. Motion carried.*

Case# 12053 – 33 & 33 ½ Jackson Street – Re-Roofing – Alex Maclachlan

Mr. Kuchenbecker reviewed his Staff Report for permission to replace existing cedar shake roofing with black asphalt shingles as submitted. Mr. Kuchenbecker said he is concerned with the proposed alteration as the cedar shingles play a significant role in the architectural style of the resources. He explained cedar is a character-defining element of original Forest Service houses and a change to this material would damage the historic integrity of the resource. He stated the State Historic Preservation Office concurs with this opinion. Mr. Kuchenbecker noted the applicant's contractor, Christian Dietz of Weather-Tite, LLC, was present to answer any questions. (The Staff Report, dated September 21, 2012, is attached hereto on Exhibit E and incorporated herein by this reference.)

Ms. Floyd asked about the difference in price between asphalt and cedar. Mr. Dietz said it is approximately 30% more to use cedar roofing material and noted a resource is significantly more expensive to insure with cedar as well. He explained the homeowner feels it is burdensome to be expected to pay more money for what he feels to be an inferior roofing system. Mr. Dietz also noted there are not very many resources in the area that still have cedar roofing. Ms. Floyd asked Mr. Kuchenbecker for information regarding other cases in which cedar shingles were replaced with asphalt. Mr. Kuchenbecker said he assumes most of the resources changed roofing material prior to the establishment of the Historic Preservation Office. Mr. Kuchenbecker also noted there may be some HP loans available if cedar is used. Ms. Floyd said while it may not be the most cost efficient roof replacement system, or the most efficient replacement material according to the applicant, cedar is the most historically appropriate material for the resources in question. ***It was moved by Ms. Floyd and seconded by Mr. Olson, based upon all the evidence presented, that the project DOES encroach upon, damage, or destroy historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places.*** Mr. Namminga asked if there are other materials that look more like cedar. Mr. Dietz said there are; however, these materials are still more expensive than cedar and are not what the applicant desires to put on the resources. ***Aye – All. Motion carried.***

It was moved by Ms. Floyd and seconded by Mr. Olson, based upon the guidance in the U.S. Department of the Interior standards for historic preservation projects in 36 C.F.R. 67, that the project is ADVERSE to Deadwood and moved to DENY the project as presented. Aye – All. Motion carried.

Case# 12054 – 68 Main Street – Demolition – KLK Ventures

Mr. Kuchenbecker reviewed his Staff Report for permission to demolish the structures located at 68 Main Street as submitted. Mr. Kuchenbecker said, if approved, there should be recordation documentation. He also noted Mr. Thomas Hill was present to answer any questions the Commission may have. (The Staff Report dated, September 21, 2012, is attached hereto on Exhibit F and incorporated herein by this reference.)

Ms. Floyd asked if there is a plan to replace the structures. Mr. Hill said KLK's plan is to remove the resources and try to sell the property. Ms. Hansen asked if removal of the property would result in a change of zoning. Mr. Kuchenbecker said it would not. Ms. Hansen asked if the utilities would be capped. Mr. Kuchenbecker said they would be capped. Mr. Hill said city code requires capping. Ms. Hansen said she wanted assurance that the site would not become an eyesore. Mr. Kuchenbecker explained this concern was outside the scope of HP's jurisdiction but rather falls under the under the city's nuisance ordinance. Mr. Olson asked if archaeology would be required when the utilities are capped. Mr. Kuchenbecker said it is exempt under the codes. Mayor Toscana noted capping of the sewer line would require very limited excavation. Mr. Namminga asked if the concrete would be removed. Mr. Hill said the plan is to leave as much concrete as possible in order to avoid the buildup of weeds etc. ***It was moved by Mr. Olson and seconded by Ms. Floyd, based upon all the evidence presented and contingent upon proper recordation, that this project DOES NOT encroach upon, damage, or destroy any historic property included in the national register of historic places or the state register of historic places, and therefore moved to grant a project approval to Case# 12054, 68 Main Street, KLK Ventures as presented. Aye – All. Motion carried.***

Revolving Loan Fund/Retaining Wall Program Update:

Retaining Wall Applications:

95 Stewart – Lori & Randy Johnston – Permission to bid wall

It was moved by Mr. Olson and seconded by Mr. Namminga to grant permission to bid the retaining wall at 95 Stewart as presented contingent upon signed documents from NeighborWorks. Aye – All. Motion carried.

25 & 29 Terrace – George Mitchell – Permission to bid wall

It was moved by Mr. Olson and seconded by Ms. Hansen to grant permission to bid the retaining wall at 25 & 29 Terrace as presented. Aye – All. Motion carried.

Financial and Delinquency Report

Ms. Joy McCracken reviewed the financial and delinquency report.

63 Taylor – John & Terry Rodiack

It was moved by Ms. Floyd and seconded by Mr. Olson to approve the loan for John and Terry Rodiack, 63 Taylor, as presented in the NeighborWorks Report dated September 20, 2012. Aye – All. Motion carried. (The NeighborWorks Report dated, September 20, 2012, is attached hereto on Exhibit G and incorporated herein by this reference.)

784 Main – Les & Shirley Karas

It was moved by Mr. Olson and seconded by Mr. Namminga to approve the loan for Les and Shirley Karas, 784 Main, as presented in the NeighborWorks Report dated September 20, 2012. Aye – All. Motion carried. (The NeighborWorks Report dated, September 20, 2012, is attached hereto on Exhibit G and incorporated herein by this reference.)

Staff Report:

Mr. Kuchenbecker reported on the following items:

- Sabo Construction had been awarded Phase III of the St. Ambrose Cemetery Restoration Project.
- Phase II of the Mt. Moriah Sign Project is complete.
- Repair of the Library's foundation was underway.
- Four public buildings would be receiving roof repairs.
- The Real Estate Workshop, which the Historic Preservation Office had co-sponsored with the State Historic Preservation Office, had been well attended with 36 individuals.
- Mr. Runge's monthly report is included in the packet and the City received a letter from Elizabeth Knopf which thanked Mr. Runge for his help while she was in town doing research and commended him for his professionalism and dedication to his job. (This letter is attached hereto on Exhibit H and incorporated herein.)
- There would be a Moon Walk on October 6 and extended an invitation to the Commission. He explained there had been some selective vegetation removal so it is once again possible to see Seth Bullock's grave from Mt. Roosevelt.
- The Commissioners had been given copies of The American Cowboy Magazine which featured an ad jointly advertising DHI and the City of Deadwood.

HPC Meeting
Wednesday, September 26, 2012

- A draft of the economic impact of Historic Preservation study, produced by Rutgers University, was available for viewing. He said this report was jointly sponsored by the Deadwood Historic Preservation Commission and the State Historic Preservation Office in Pierre.

Other Business:

Ms. Floyd apologized for missing the last Loan Committee Meeting and thanked Ms. McCracken for briefing her.

Mayor Toscana thanked Mr. Runge for his help. He explained he had recently traveled to Italy and Mr. Runge's research into his family's genealogy had been very useful while there.

Mr. Van Den Eykel said he had recently been up to Mt. Roosevelt and noted it was very impressive.

Mayor Toscana thanked Mr. Kuchenbecker and Virginia Peterson along with all who had attended the annual budget presentation in Pierre, for all of the work to get the budget unanimously approved.

Mr. Namminga noted Mr. Runge had given a very nice presentation at the Lawrence County Historical Society recently.

Adjournment:

There being no other business, the Deadwood Historic Preservation Commission Meeting of September 12, 2012 adjourned at 5:50 p.m.

ATTEST:

Matthew Pike
Chairman, Historic Preservation Commission
VPeterson, Recording Secretary